SYMPOSIUM
THE LAW AND ECONOMICS OF PROVIDING COMPENSATION FOR HARM CAUSED BY TERRORISM
Conference sponsored by The John M. Olin Program in Law and Economics
Georgetown University Law Center
April 2002

Introduction to the Symposium
Warren F. Schwartz

Compensation for Victims of Terror: A Specialized Jurisprudence of Injury
Marshall S. Shapo

A Pig in a Python: How the Charitable Response to September 11 Overwhelmed the Law of Disaster Relief
Robert A. Katz

Providing Compensation for Harm Caused by Terrorism: Lessons Learned in the Israeli Experience
Hillel Sommer

The Economics of Post-September 11 Financial Aid to Airlines
Margaret M. Blair

Exclusion of Terrorist-Related Harms from Insurance Coverage: Do the Costs Justify the Benefits?
Jeffrey E. Thomas

Income Tax as Implicit Insurance Against Losses from Terrorism
Terrence Chorvat
Elizabeth Chorvat

Terrorism and Insurance Markets: A Role for the Government as Insurer?
Anne Gron
Alan O. Sykes
Raise the Bar

BNA’s United States Law Week

For 65 years, U.S. Law Week has consistently raised the standard of excellence in legal reporting. Today’s Law Week is a powerful research and notification tool that does more for you than ever:

- **Case Alert:** A summary and analysis of the most significant court opinions nationwide, with electronic access to full text.
- **Legal News:** Reports on non-judicial developments, including legal analysis and perspective, important legislation, and administrative rulemakings.
- **Supreme Court Today:** Daily coverage of the status of every case before the U.S. Supreme Court and all Court proceedings.
- **Supreme Court Opinions:** Full text of decisions, with headnotes and counsel listings, daily online, weekly in print.

There’s no more complete, authoritative way to keep up with all areas of the law than U.S. Law Week.

**FREE TRIALS!**
In print for 5 weeks FREE! CALL 800-372-1033
On the Web for 15 days FREE!
GO TO www.bna.com/trials/lwex511.htm

Visit BNA’s Professional Information Center
http://litigationcenter.bna.com
Indiana Law Review

Volume 36 2002-2003

Editor-in-Chief
Kirby W. Lee

Executive Managing Editor
Brian K. Gromminger

Senior Executive Editor
Katherine E. McCanna

Symposium Editor
Kellye M. Gordon

Articles Editors
David R. Brimm
Gregory A. Cox
Jennifer L. Dolak
Elaine L. Guidroz
Brett J. Henry
Juliana M. Plawecki
Kevin S. Price
John J. Schroeder
Terry Thomson

Articles Editors
David R. Brimm
Gregory A. Cox
Jennifer L. Dolak
Elaine L. Guidroz
Brett J. Henry
Juliana M. Plawecki
Kevin S. Price
John J. Schroeder
Terry Thomson

Executive Notes Editor
Bonnie B. Phillips

Executive Articles Editors
Homer W. Faucett, III
Janet A. Gongola

Note Development Editors
Amy S. Ford
Scott J. Linneweber
Joseph E. Parrish
David E. Roberts
Shannon M. Shaw
Laura E. Trulock

Associate Editors
Dawn M. Adams
Jeffrey M. Cromer
Polly J. Dobbs
Monica S. Doerr
Adam Asad Gaha

Lucy A. Khairy
Michael P. O'Bryan
Amy L. Schoettle
Andrij B. Susla

Members
E. Renee Backmeyer
Jeffrey S. Beck
Michael A. Benefield
J. Michael Bowman
Jessica L. Burks
Jamie B. Dameron
Paula K. Davis
Shelley S. Fraser
Kevin J. Gfell
Cassandra A. Giles
Anthony H. Green
J. Matt Harnish
Barbara L. Hendrickson
Heidi K. Hughes
Hannah Kaufman
Adam J. Krupp
Melissa Lindley
Kevin L. McLaren, Ph.D.
Alexander L. Mounts
Michael J. Natali
Kathryn E. Ours
Sarah L. Pierce
Jeffrey D. Preston
Peter J. Prettyman
C.W. Raines, III
Julie D. Reed
Nathaniel Saylor
Jared A. Simmons
Christopher G. Stevenson
Allan A. Wasson
Michael D. Wilhelm
Stephen M. Worth
John C. Wright

Editorial Specialist
Chris Paynter

Faculty Advisors
Andrew R. Klein
R. George Wright
INDIANA LAW REVIEW

(ISN 0090-4198)

Published four times a year by Indiana University. Editorial and Business Offices are located at:

Indiana Law Review
Lawrence W. Inlow Hall
530 W. New York Street
Indianapolis, IN 46202-3225
(317) 274-4440

Subscriptions. Current subscription rates for an academic year are $30.00 (domestic mailing) and $35.00 (foreign mailing) for four issues. Unless the Business Office receives notice to the contrary, all subscriptions will be renewed automatically. Address changes must be received at least one month prior to publication to ensure prompt delivery and must include old and new address and the proper zip code.

Single and Back Issues. Current single regular issues may be obtained from the Indiana Law Review Business Office for $10.00. Current Survey issues may be purchased for $20.00. The Symposium Issue may be purchased for $15.00. Please enclose payment with order. Claims for nonreceipt of current year's issues must be made within six months of the mailing date. Back issues may be ordered from: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 1285 Main St., Buffalo, NY 14209-1987, (800) 828-7571, (716) 883-8100 fax, mail@wshein.com (e-mail for orders).

Manuscripts. The Indiana Law Review invites submission of unsolicited manuscripts. All citations should conform to The Bluebook A Uniform System of Citation (17th ed. 2000). Manuscripts should be double-spaced with standard one-inch margins. The Indiana Law Review, as a matter of policy, promotes the use of gender-neutral language, and alternate use of the female or male pronoun is intended to refer to both female and male.

Copyright: Copyright 2003. The Trustees of Indiana University. Except as may be expressly provided elsewhere in this publication, permission is hereby granted to produce and distribute copies of individual works from this publication for nonprofit education purposes, provided that copies are distributed at or below cost, and that the author, source, and copyright notice are included on each copy. This permission is in addition to rights of reproduction granted under Sections 107, 108, and other provisions of the U.S. Copyright Act.

The INDIANA LAW REVIEW (ISSN 0090-4198) is the property of Indiana University and is published quarterly by the Indiana University School of Law—Indianapolis, which assumes complete editorial responsibility thereof. Current subscription rates for an academic year are: one year domestic $30.00; foreign $35.00. Send all correspondence to Editorial Specialist, Indiana Law Review, Indiana University School of Law—Indianapolis, Lawrence W. Inlow Hall, 530 W. New York Street, Indianapolis, Indiana 46202-3225. Publication office: 530 W. New York Street, Indianapolis, Indiana 46202-3225. Periodicals postage paid at Indianapolis, Indiana 46201.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to INDIANA LAW REVIEW, Lawrence W. Inlow Hall, 530 W. New York Street, Indianapolis, Indiana 46202-3225.

The entire text of this Law Review is printed on recycled paper.
Indiana
International &
Comparative
Law Review

The Indiana International & Comparative Law Review, published by the Indiana University School of Law- Indianapolis since 1991, is a student-edited law journal that provides a forum for the discussion and analysis of contemporary issues in public and private international law. The Review publishes articles by prominent legal scholars, practitioners, and policy makers from around the world, as well as student-written notes and comments.

The Review is published twice annually, with a periodic third issue devoted to a specific topic in international or comparative law. In 1994, in conjunction with the Italian Academy for Advanced Studies in America at Columbia University, the Review published a special issue on the political and social aspects of Italian law. In 1996, the Review published an issue addressing various aspects of Chinese law.

Name

School/Firm/Business

Address

City, State, Zip Code

Subscriptions within the U.S. are $18.00 per year and outside the U.S. are $21.00 per year. I enclose $_________ for ________ subscription(s) to the Indiana International & Comparative Law Review. Please make your check payable to Indiana International & Comparative Law Review.

Mail to: Executive Production Editor
Indiana International & Comparative Law Review
Lawrence W. Inlow Hall
530 West New York Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46202
Please enter my subscription to the
INDIANA LAW REVIEW

NAME

ADDRESS:

Enclosed is $_____ for ____ subscription(s)

Mail to:  ATTN: Law Review Specialist
 at
INDIANA LAW REVIEW
INDIANA UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW—INDIANAPOLIS
Lawrence W. Inlow Hall
530 West New York Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46202-3225

For an academic year, the subscription rate for four issues is:
*Domestic, $30; Foreign, $35; Student, $20*
*Single Issue, $10; Survey Issue, $20*
*Symposium Issue, $15*
Indiana University School of Law—Indianapolis

2002-2003 ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS AND FACULTY

Administrative Officers

GERALD L. BEPKO, Interim President, Indiana University and Professor of Law. B.S., Northern Illinois University; J.D., ITT/Chicago-Kent College of Law; LL.M., Yale University.

WILLIAM M. PLATER, Interim Chancellor, Indiana University-Purdue University—Indianapolis. B.A., M.A., Ph.D., University of Illinois.

ANTHONY A. TARR, Dean and Professor of Law. B.A., LL.B., University of Natal; LL.M., Cambridge University; Ph.D., University of Canterbury; Ph.D., Cambridge University.

THOMAS B. ALLINGTON, Associate Dean for Technology and Professor of Law. B.S., J.D., University of Nebraska; LL.M., New York University.

JEFFREY W. GROVE, Associate Dean for Graduate Studies, Professor of Law, and Director, China Summer Program. A.B., Juniata College; J.D., George Washington University.

SUSANAH M. MEAD, Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law. B.A., Smith College; J.D., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

CYNTHIA BAKER, Director, Program on Law and State Government. B.A., J.D., Valparaiso University.

ELIZABETH L. DECOUX, Assistant Dean for Student Affairs. J.D., Mississippi College School of Law.

ANGELA M. ESPADA, Assistant Dean for Admissions. J.D., Indiana University—Bloomington.

JONNA KANE MACDOUGALL, Assistant Dean for External Affairs. J.D., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

CAROL B. NEARY, Director of Development. B.A., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

SHANNON L. WILLIAMS, Director of Professional Development. B.S., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

Faculty

CYNTHIA M. ADAMS, Clinical Associate Professor of Law. B.A., Kentucky Wesleyan College; J.D., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

THOMAS B. ALLINGTON, Associate Dean for Technology and Professor of Law. B.S., J.D., University of Nebraska; LL.M., New York University.

JAMES F. BAILEY, III, Professor of Law and Director of Law Library. A.B., J.D., M.A.L.S., University of Michigan.

GERALD L. BEPKO, Interim President, Indiana University and Professor of Law. B.S., Northern Illinois University; J.D., ITT/Chicago-Kent College of Law; LL.M., Yale University.

FRANK BOWMAN, Associate Professor of Law. B.A., Colorado College; J.D., Harvard Law School.

WILLIAM C. BRADFORD, Assistant Professor of Law. B.A., M.A., University of Miami; Ph.D., Northwestern University; J.D., University of Miami School of Law; LL.M., Harvard Law School.

ROBERT BROOKINS, Professor of Law. B.S., University of South Florida; J.D., Ph.D., Cornell University.


JEFFREY O. COOPER, Associate Professor of Law. A.B., Harvard University; J.D., University of Pennsylvania.

PAUL N. COX, Centennial Professor of Law. B.S., Utah State University; J.D., University of Utah; LL.M., University of Virginia.

ROBIN KUNDIS CRAIG, Associate Professor of Law. B.A., Pomona College; M.A., The Johns Hopkins University; Ph.D., University of California; J.D., Lewis and Clark School of Law.

KENNETH D. CREWS, Associate Dean of the Faculties for Copyright Management and Professor of Law and Library and Information Science. B.A., Northwestern University; J.D., Washington University; M.L.S., University of California, Los Angeles; Ph.D., University of California, Los Angeles.

JAMES D. DIMITRI, Clinical Associate Professor of Law. B.S., Indiana University; J.D., Valparaiso University School of Law.
Emeriti

EDWARD P. ARCHER, Professor of Law Emeritus. B.M.E., Renesselaer Polytechnic Institute; J.D., LL.M., Georgetown University.

AGNES P. BARRETT, Associate Professor of Law Emerita. B.S., J.D., Indiana University.

CLYDE HARRISON CROCKETT, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., J.D., University of Texas; LL.M., University of London (The London School of Economics and Political Science).

DEBRA A. FALENDER, Professor of Law Emerita. A.B., Mount Holyoke College; J.D., Indiana University—Indianapolis.

CLEON H. FOUST, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., Wabash College; J.D., University of Arizona.

DAVID A. FUNK, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., College of Wooster; J.D., Case Western Reserve University; M.A., The Ohio State University; LL.M., Case Western Reserve University; LL.M., Columbia University.

PAUL J. GALANTI, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., Bowdoin College; J.D., University of Chicago.

HELEN P. GARFIELD, Professor of Law Emerita. B.S.J., Northwestern University; J.D., University of Colorado.

HAROLD GREENBERG, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., Temple University; J.D., University of Pennsylvania.

WILLIAM F. HARVEY, Carl M. Gray Professor of Law & Advocacy Emeritus. A.B., University of Missouri; J.D., LL.M., Georgetown University.

W. WILLIAM HODES, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., Harvard College; J.D., Rutgers, Newark.

WILLIAM ANDREW KERR, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., West University; J.D., LL.M., Harvard University; B.S., Duke University.

WILLIAM E. MARSH, Professor of Law Emeritus. B.S., J.D., University of Nebraska.

RONALD W. POLSTON, Professor of Law Emeritus. B.S., Eastern Illinois University; LL.B., University of Illinois.

KENNETH M. STROUD, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., J.D., Indiana University—Bloomington.

JAMES PATRICK WHITE, Professor of Law Emeritus. A.B., University of Iowa; J.D., LL.M., George Washington University.

Law Library Faculty

JAMES F. BAILEY, III, Professor and Director of Law Library. A.B., J.D., M.A.L.S., University of Michigan.

MARY HUDSON, Reference/Circulation Librarian. B.A., Ball State; M.L.S., Indiana University.

RICHARD HUMPHREY, Reference Librarian. A.A., Brewton-Parker Junior College; B.A., Georgia Southwestern College; M.L.S., University of Kentucky.


CHRIS E. LONG, Catalog Librarian. B.A., Indiana University; M.A., Indiana University; M.L.S., Indiana University.

MAHNAZ K. MOHSEFEGH, Acquisition/Serials Librarian. B.A., National University of Iran; M.S., Tehran University; M.A., Ball State University; M.L.S., Ph.D., Indiana University.

MIAMI A. MURPHY, Associate Director of Law Library. B.A., Purdue University; J.D., M.L.S., Indiana University—Bloomington.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SYMPOSIUM

ARTICLES

Introduction to the Symposium .......................... Warren F. Schwartz 229

Compensation for Victims of Terror: A Specialized Jurisprudence of Injury ...................... Marshall S. Shapo 237

A Pig in a Python: How the Charitable Response to September 11 Overwhelmed the Law of Disaster Relief ............................ Robert A. Katz 251

Providing Compensation for Harm Caused by Terrorism: Lessons Learned in the Israeli Experience .... Hillel Sommer 335

The Economics of Post-September 11 Financial Aid to Airlines ............................. Margaret M. Blair 367

Exclusion of Terrorist-Related Harms from Insurance Coverage: Do the Costs Justify the Benefits? .................. Jeffrey E. Thomas 397

Income Tax as Implicit Insurance Against Losses from Terrorism ......................... Terrence Chorvat 425 Elizabeth Chorvat

Terrorism and Insurance Markets: A Role for the Government as Insurer? ................ Anne Gron 447 Alan O. Sykes