Appendix 1: Rubrics

Rubric Used for Internal Medicine Clerkship

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| FORMULATE PICO AND CLINICAL QUERY | | | |
| Inadequate - 0 | Needs Improvement - 1 | Meets Expectations - 3 | Exceeds Expectations - 5 |
| None of the previous present. | A general PICO and clinical query with few specific details about the case at hand.   * Mentions intervention but unlikely to contribute to search. * Reference to outcome, but so general as to be unlikely to contribute to a search. | Generates a reasonable PICO and clinical query that can be used for a literature search.   * Defines some of the items in column one (EE); example: Mentions type of intervention without specifics. | Generates a well-built PICO and clinical query that can be used for a literature search. Clearly defines:   * Population * Specific Intervention * Comparison (specific alternatives of interest) * Outcome that is objective and meaningful to patient.   Query is relevant and justifiable. |
| SEARCH THE MEDICAL LITERATURE | | | |
| Inadequate - 0 | Needs Improvement - 1 | Meets Expectation - 3 | Exceeds Expectations - 5 |
| None of the previous present. | Poor choice of search terms, elements missing, extraneous terms.  Uses weak Internet resources. | Searches missing needed subject headings and limits.  Uses library or acceptable Internet resources. | Logically constructed search with all relevant terms and nothing extraneous, with appropriate limits, subject headings, etc.   * Uses library resources * Variety of Best Sources * Convenience * Clinical Relevance * Validity * Explains the process of selecting a specific article and why it was selected. * Picked an original study, not a systematic review or meta-analysis. |

Rubric Used for Pediatrics Clerkship

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. PICO QUESTION | | | |
| Inadequate - 0 | Needs Improvement - 1 | Meets Expectations - 2 | Exceeds Expectations - 3 |
| None of the previous present. | PICO is too vague/lacking details in more than one area.  Elements may be out of order. | Generates a reasonable PICO and clinical query that can be used for a literature search.   * Define some of the items in column one (EE); example: Mentions type of intervention without specifics. | Generates a well-built PICO and clinical query that can be used for a literature search. Clearly defines:   * Population * Specific Intervention * Comparison (specific alternatives of interest) * Outcome that is objective and meaningful to patient.   Query is relevant and justifiable. |
| 1. SEARCH METHOD | | | |
| Inadequate - 0 | Needs Improvement - 1 | Meets Expectations - 2 | Exceeds Expectations - 3 |
| None of the previous present. | Only identifies major concepts as keywords from PICO.  No structure.  Results lack precision. | Major concept keywords are coupled with MeSH.  Search displays structure.  Results are reasonable and have sufficient precision. | Major concept keywords include multiple synonyms and MeSH.  Appropriate filters are used.    Search structure shows ability to leverage database functions.  Results show precision and specificity. |

Rubric Used for OB/GYN Clerkship

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| PICO Method | | | |
| Not observed – 0 | Needs attention - 1 | Developing - 2 | Achieved – 3 |
| Not applicable | PICO is too vague/lacking details in more than one area.  Elements may be out of order. | PICO includes all of the appropriate elements and in the correct order. | PICO includes all the appropriate elements and in the correct order with sufficient detail.  Outcome includes both clinical and patient elements (if applicable) and shows measurability. |
| Search Method | | | |
| Not observed – 0 | Needs attention - 1 | Developing - 2 | Achieved – 3 |
| NA | Only identifies major concepts as keywords from PICO.  No structure.  Results lack precision. | Major concept keywords are coupled with MeSH.  Search displays structure.  Results are reasonable and have sufficient precision. | Major concept keywords includes multiple synonyms and MeSH.  Appropriate filters are used.  Search structure shows ability to leverage database functions.  Results show precision and specificity. |